"They didn't treat me as a Gypsy": Romani Refugees in Toronto

CYNTHIA LEVINE-RASKY[1]

Abstract

With organized hate crime and institutionalized discrimination, thousands of European Roma have fled to Canada, where they claim refugee status. Their arrival coincided with far-ranging reforms to the refugee determination system in 2012–13 in addition to some actions aimed specifically at the Roma. Against this backdrop, former and current Romani refugee claimants substantiate the experience of migration and settlement, beginning with the first moments after arrival, to the tasks of finding housing and work. Agency and resilience are evinced, despite the government's multiple instruments used against asylum-seekers. Romani refugees' lives show how, for transnational groups, belongingness is always contested and the meaning of home is always nuanced.

Résumé

En raison des crimes organisés motivés par la haine et de la discrimination institutionnelle, des milliers de Roms européens ont cherché asile au Canada où ils ont effectué des demandes du statut de réfugié. Leur arrivée a coïncidé avec des réformes de grande ampleur en 2012-13 portant sur le système de détermination du statut de réfugié, ainsi que des mesures visant les Roms particulièrement. C'est dans ce contexte que les anciens ainsi que les actuels demandeurs du statut de réfugié d'origine rom réalisent l'expérience de migration et d'installation, en allant des premiers moments après leur arrivée jusqu'aux démarches qu'ils entreprennent pour trouver des logements et du travail. Un esprit d'actualisation et de persévérance se manifeste, malgré les multiples mesures imposées par le gouvernement à l'encontre des chercheurs d'asile. L'expérience des réfugiés d'origine rom démontre que, pour les groupes transnationaux, l'appartenance est toujours soumise à la contestation, et que l'idée de domicile est toujours conditionnelle.

The Roma are an ethnically distinct social group who originate from the northwestern Indian provinces of Punjab, Rajasthan, and Sindh, from where they departed in the eleventh century. They are the largest minority group in Europe with a population of 10–12 million.[2] The Roma population in Canada has been estimated at 80,000, but with immigration since the 1990s it has likely reached 100,000. They have lived in Canada for over 100 years,[3] but it was only in the 1990s that their immigration status and larger numbers converged to elicit a response from the Canadian government. The demise of state socialism, rampant discrimination, and the rise of anti-Roma violence by paramilitary groups and others are among factors responsible for their migration as asylum-seekers from Europe to Canada. Between 1998 and 2015, 35,015 refugee claims were made by people from Central and Eastern European (CEE) countries with large Romani populations: Croatia, Czech Republic, Hungary, Romania, and Slovakia (comprising 7.3 per cent of claims from all countries). Hungarians represent 67 per cent of that figure, of which perhaps 85 per cent are Roma.[4] Reception to the Romani newcomers in Canada was largely unfavourable as they encountered legislative and policy barriers to their settlement. Those seeking to settle in Canada express agency and resilience while the memory of systemic racism in Europe is fresh, and with the knowledge that their desire to remain in the country may be thwarted at any moment. Ethnographic research with Romani individuals in Toronto produced rich narratives of resourcefulness and optimism. Stories attest not only to personal capacities for endurance during the travails of migration, but also for hope vested in the early foundations of belongingness.

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

Overview of the Research

During my ethnographic research from 2011 to 2015 at the Roma Community Centre in Toronto, for which I received ethics approval in the summer of 2011, I interviewed forty-six individuals from a cross-section of Roma and collected hundreds of pages of field notes, communications, and documents. As an active volunteer, I was involved in programs and events, grant-writing, organizational development, advocacy, and activism. Recruitment for interviews stemmed largely from my contacts at the Roma Community Centre, but also from some local Romani musicians whom I have known since 1998. I took a grounded theory approach to the qualitative analysis of the data in which seven broad salient categories emerged: the Roma people, the effects of anti-Roma racism, life in Europe, life in Toronto, life as a refugee claimant, personal goals and achievements, and community building. This article focuses on two of these—life in Toronto, and life as a refugee claimant—from the perspective of former and current refugee claimants. Other themes are explored elsewhere.[5] Interviews were about two hours long, recorded and transcribed, and translated where necessary. The fourteen adult refugee claimants and their children (comprising ten families) had arrived between 2009 and 2012 from Hungary and Croatia. By the spring of 2015, four of the ten claimant families had been accepted as refugees, and they had received permanent residence status. One was rejected and had received a repatriation order, three were still waiting for a decision, and the fate of two is unknown.

My aim was to hear individuals' stories and to embed their words in a social context in order to understand this historically oppressed group. Consistent with community-based participatory research, my work is informed by the principle of epistemic privilege of community members in which their critical insights are recognized as authoritative on the basis of their authentic and personal knowledge.[6] Highlighting refugee voices counteracts the tendency to construct refugees as of a universal kind—victims instead of actors engaged at a particular juncture with history. But refugees are the best experts of their situations, and when their experiences are discounted or regarded as untrustworthy, they are rendered speechless.[7] Their experience is depoliticized, even as it conveys crucial narratives of political, historical, and cultural practices on which refugee aid programs and determination decisions are made. For this reason, research must reserve a central forum for refugees' voices.

In Canada, several researchers have respected this approach. While diverging in emphasis, conclusions affirm refugees' productive capacities. Omidvar and Wagner dedicate their exclusive purpose to thirty refugees' stories covering the fullest range of experiences.[8] Lacroix's eight interview participants in Montreal describe rebuilding their identity out of the stigma, material hardship, loss of status, and subjection to state intervention that they experience.[9] Interviews with ten asylum-seekers in Montreal led Manjikian to affirm refugees' agency as they create meaningful lives on their own terms.[10] Freund shows how the fifty-three refugees in Winnipeg from he obtained oral histories make "home along the journey." Their tethers are just as likely to be to kin or to the local as they are to be the nation.[11] In his field research on Romani refugees in Toronto, Acuña discusses interviews with two individuals and discovers that "resilience can very well mean the capacity of starting anew."[12] A few European authors have captured some Romani refugees' voices about reasons for migration to Canada, work, and challenges to settlement.[13]

Interview participants entrusted me with memories "overwhelmed by occurrences that have not settled into understanding … events in excess of [my] frames of reference."[14] Stories I heard of life in Europe—homes set aflame, gang rape, a child deliberately attacked by a dog—taxed my capacity to theorize this knowledge. Encouraged by critical race sociologist David Theo Goldberg, I sought to sustain an "openness to the deep and abiding influences of those deemed Other … and being moved by the positions and ideas of those who have been marginalized."[15] Against the disturbing backdrop of their transnational encounters, their narratives of resilience and optimism are a testament to strength in adversity. The specific nature of this adversity can be learned by examining two sets of conditions for Romani refugee claimants. One is located in CEE in the form of persecution propelling their migration outward. The second is located in Canada in the form of policy changes oriented against asylum-seekers in general, and sometimes against the Roma specifically. Each of these sites is explored in the next sections.

Conditions in Europe

For the Roma, state socialism in CEE was both beneficial and costly. The Roma's socioeconomic status improved with assured employment, housing, and education, but formal equality was granted at the expense of cultural assimilation. Along with centralized states' increased social and political control over them,[16] kinship ties were weakened and traditional crafts were lost.[17] The Roma's manner of life was regarded as divergent from socialist ideals. Soviet leaders implemented programs to suppress it by putting the Roma to work on the socialist production line or as unskilled workers in industry. As a consequence, the entrepreneurship and versatility that had been the Roma's conventional means of subsistence was extinguished. When traditional skills as producers of household products, foresters, blacksmithing,

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

and music performance were rendered redundant, some Roma turned to scavenging and begging or trade in the black market.[18]

With the collapse of the socialist regime, economic conditions in the region deteriorated for majority and minority groups alike. Hate crime grew as nationalist extremists organized themselves and took violent action against the easiest of targets.[19] Extending the common explanation that extremists scapegoat ethnic minorities, theorists assert that groups like the Roma embody an imagined threat to consensus on political and social values.[20] Minorities are blamed for the state's failure to deliver the rewards of global capitalism and to fulfill the fantasy of a pure nationhood.[21] Situated precariously at the border of the ethnic nation state, the Roma are accused of intrusion, indolence, ill will, criminality, or any such thing "feeding parasitically on the social body."[22] That they allegedly lack a primordial bond to society is feared as an absence of commitment to the common good. Exploiting these fears, national leaders seize the Roma as safe objects with which to demonstrate their political power. When the state is incapable of protecting its citizens from the ravages of global economic forces, it turns instead to the suppression of its national ethnic minorities. States require the continuous renewal of the Roma's vulnerabilities against which they can demonstrate their powers.

This state of affairs gives rise to the Roma's extraordinary susceptibility to violence. In Hungary, the source country for the large majority of recent Romani newcomers in Canada, the European Roma Rights Centre documented sixty-one attacks against Roma and their property between January 2008 and September 2012.[23] An unprecedented series of violent acts occurred in the country in 2008–9. Known as the "Roma Murders," these crimes were carried out as a series of attacks on random Romani individuals in several villages. Canada's Immigration and Refugee Board describes these attacks as "planned with military precision" involving a "pattern of firebombing houses on the periphery of villages at night, and then shooting at inhabitants as they attempted to escape the burning house."[24] These and countless other anti-Roma hate crimes are tolerated by the ruling Fidesz Party and often carried out by a paramilitary movement with deep connections to the far-right Jobbik Party.[25] The problem is not unique to Hungary. Fascist political parties like the Workers' Party for Social Justice in the Czech Republic, Our Slovakia People's Party, Bulgaria's National Union Attack, the Northern League in Italy, Austria's Freedom Party, and Golden Dawn in Greece all promulgate anti-Roma beliefs and often orchestrate actions intended to intimidate the Roma.[26]

Apart from anti-Roma hate crime, institutionalized discrimination against the Roma excludes them from schools, jobs, housing, health care, and policing. Unemployment rates for Roma in some parts of Hungary reach 85–90 per cent stretching back three decades.[27] Like the rise of organized violence, these conditions are paralleled in other CEE countries. Consolidating research for twelve countries in CEE, the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe confirms the precarious or substandard living conditions for Roma.[28] With conditions qualifying as persecution,[29] thousands of Roma flee to Canada, where they claim refugee status. While the largest numbers arrive from Hungary, the Roma also come from the Czech Republic, Romania, Slovakia, Poland, Croatia, Kosovo, Bulgaria, Macedonia, the Ukraine, and elsewhere.

The Political Response to Romani Asylum-seekers in Canada

Two large movements of Hungarian Roma arrived seeking asylum in Canada—9,569 in 1998–2002, and 11,045 in 2009–12. Their acceptance rates by the Immigration and Refugee Board averaged 33 per cent for the earlier group (compared to a national average of 58 per cent), and 24 per cent for the latter group (compared to a national average of 47 per cent), numbers that fall to 18 and 6 per cent when abandoned and withdrawn claims are taken into account.[30] The numbers reflect some unusual actions taken by political leaders and immigration officials to reject the Roma and to discourage those who remained in Europe from migrating to Canada:

1. The Immigration and Refugee Board's 1998 Lead Case initiative. Designed to ensure consistent decision-making among IRB members and "non-binding guidance" in similar cases, the IRB assembled a Hungarian delegation to advise them on conditions for national Roma and the strength of state protection for them.
2. Repeated imposition and removal of travel visas for Hungary in 2001 and 2007 and for Czech Republic in 1998, 2007, 2009, and 2012.
3. Protecting Canada's Immigration System Act that passed in 2012 included Designated Countries of Origin (DCO) or "safe" countries differentiating classes of refugee claimants, subjecting one group to an expedited determination process, and disqualifying them from important channels of appeal.[31] The system's undue effect on the Roma is evident in the fact that (with the exception of Mexico), Hungary and other CEE countries were the largest source of DCO claims.
4. The actions of Citizenship and Immigration Minister Jason Kenney, including his frequent use of the term *bogus* to describe the "European" claimants.[32] During his diplomatic visit to Hungary on 9 October 2012, intended to stop "the abuse of our system and generosity by bogus asylum claimants,"[33] Kenney was quoted

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

on the far-right, government-controlled Hungarian television station HIR TV: "Being a refugee is not just about whether they like the state they're living in or not, and it's not about whether life is easy there or not, nor is it about occasional acts of discrimination."[34] Kenney oversaw a $13,000 billboard campaign[35] in the city of Miskolz, home to large numbers of Romani claimants. The billboards read, "In order to avoid abuse, Canada's refugee determination system has changed. Those whose claims are unfounded ARE SENT BACK HOME FASTER."[36] Radio announcements and ads in bus shelters supplemented the campaign.[37]

5. Disqualification of refugee claimants from DCOs from the Interim Federal Health Benefit[38] for any health care other than that required to prevent or treat a "disease posing a risk to public health" or a "condition of public safety concern."

Some elements in the panoply of policy instruments and other actions aimed at refugees were earmarked for the Roma. What impact, if any, did these initiatives have on those Romani claimants who were accepted? What are their narratives of migration, and what does their content tell us about the will to adapt, to endure, and to flourish despite the state's response? In order to hear the nuance of meaning and the particularity of experience, we turn to refugees' narratives. As Malkki asserts, the popular call to give oppressed people a voice is not aimed at a sanguine empowerment, but at filling the policy void with appropriate content informed by the desire for historical accountability.[39]

Entering Canada

In the following excerpts, all names are pseudonyms. While original wording is preserved, lengths of remarks are reduced and consolidated as indicated by ellipses. The only changes made to the excerpts are minor grammatical corrections where it affects comprehension. Speakers are identified after each excerpt with minimal personal details in order to ensure confidentiality.

> I had a house from my grandfather … I was asked if I could sell the property … for a parking lot to sell cars. Italians … gave me $15,000. And that money, I arrived in Poland. And in Poland, some friend came there, and he told me that he can take me anywhere in the world. I gave him my passport and $10,000 and he took me, the old lady [wife] and the girl [daughter], and we went to the airplane and the same man came with us to Canada. He brought us to Buffalo. He told us to go over there, to the border. I asked for my passport, and he said he'd send it to us by mail, but we never got it. Just a copy … We saw the Canadian flag, and there was a police there, border guards, and then we signed some documents and were asked where we want to go. I said Toronto. We were given some money and put in a hotel, the [name withheld] shelter in Toronto. The staff prepared papers for us. It took almost three years with the Immigration and Refugee Board. Now I need a passport and a pension. (Jules, permanent resident, arrived in 2003)

> When I arrived, several other Roma families were arriving on the same plane. They put all the Romani people in one room at the airport … They did not let people go out … They wouldn't let me buy a Coke or any drinks for my kids. They didn't do anything for us … I felt like I was in a jail. We were there for nine hours … When they took our pictures, and provided our IDs with our pictures … I was smiling. Because I was finally free. There were people here we knew from [withheld]. They came to pick us up with two cars and take us to Mississauga where there was a refugee shelter … I was shocked at the shelter because they were so kind, which I had never experienced before. They were asking a lot of questions like are we hungry, what do we need, they told us everything what we had to do in this shelter. But they were so kind like I had never experienced before. They provided everything we needed. (Ruby, refugee claimant, arrived in 2010)

> I want to tell you that they were so rough with us. Everything was by force, to explain long stories to make it very, very short, and just yes or no. You can't explain anything. They terrorized us. We get so scared. The children think we're in jail and held for twenty-four hours … We tell them we're hungry. They tell us that whatever we ate at home, eat here also … When he called my name, I go into a small room. There were two police there … When I ask for help, I gave my interview after maybe four hours, then she said, "OK you are free. You can go." I said, "Where do I go? I don't speak English, I don't have money. I need your help. Some shelter or something." She said, "You can go out to sleep … Canada's free. You can go out from airport" … I asked people … This woman helped me … she called for me one shelter, and a taxi. If not for her, I don't know what would have happened … I think they need more patience when they ask who are you and where are you from. A little bit more, I don't know, heart. But some people are so cold … When you speak to him, he thinks you are very low … But you are a person, so is he. We can talk to each other. (Aida and Azra, refugee claimants, arrived in 2012)

These stories of life as a refugee claimant at Canada's doorstep begin with Jules's and his family's flight from violence, a migration spurred by foreigners' purchase of his property. What comes next sounds suspiciously like a case of human trafficking or at least the shady business of those who "manage" journeys for refugees. Jules gambled almost everything he had to leave his country. His migration to Canada is fraught with uncertainty and vulnerability exploited by unscrupulous handlers. When I met him, his

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

desire for a Canadian passport was acute. He continues to request advocacy to obtain documents to improve his family's status. Ruby tells of the interminable wait while being processed by immigration officers at the airport. Undefeated by the frightening episode at the airport, she discovers the kindness of settlement staff, remembered with fondness. Ruby strives to belong in the midst of the chaos of refugee life. Her positive experience at the refugee shelter is echoed by single mothers and friends Aida and Azra, who were interviewed together (and with another friend, Tem). Their stories reiterate the poor treatment of refugees at the airport. Unable to call upon a support network for help, Aida searches in vain for the humanity of airport immigration personnel. Azra finds it in a passer-by. After experiencing this utter insecurity, the two women quickly became allies, found housing and employment, and sent their children to Toronto schools. When I saw them, they reported that their children—five in all—were doing well.

Like the refugees interviewed by Acuña, Freund, and Manjikian, the resilience expressed by these four interlocutors conveys a determination to endure the fear and uncertainty of migration and an investment in constructing a sense of belonging to this new place. Their willingness to share their narratives with me, a non-Romani stranger accompanied by a native-speaking friend, is a demonstration of hope. For groups such as the Roma, the memory of historical trauma[40] justifies their skepticism toward researchers. They could feel justifiable concern about jeopardizing their refugee hearing or exacerbating their already uncertain potential to find housing and a job. They have little grounds for believing that they would be treated with respect. But their full cooperation in the interview hints at their urgent wish to feel safe in Canada. It also intimates their optimism in the future, specifically in making Toronto their home. These earliest expressions of belongingness are all the more remarkable in the context of the hostile conditions they left behind, and of their contested status they discovered upon arriving in Canada. The next section explores optimism once individuals have spent sufficient time settling in the city.

Life in Toronto

> [My experience in Canada has] never been negative. Even if some people know what a Gypsy is, they would never call me a Gypsy, or say, "OK, I'm going to put my wallet away because you may steal it from me." Or, "I'm not going to give you a job to do the [occupation withheld] because you're going to mess up that job" … My father had a lot of connections … But I couldn't get a job … Not even simple jobs like sweeping streets … I had to take a chance elsewhere … I didn't want to stay here, because it [was a] different world. But things worked out well and very quickly for me. I opened a business in a very short period of time, and people trusted me … I wasn't discriminated against here … And people respected me and looked at me like everybody else … managers came and asked me for my opinion which is very rare in [withheld]… that was an eye-opener for me. So I said to myself, here they treat you as a human being. They don't treat you like an idiot, or someone who doesn't know anything. You can use your brain. They treat you like a normal person … They didn't treat me as a Gypsy … The most important thing in my experience was that they treated me as a human being based on what I do, not on the colour of my skin. (Frank, permanent resident, arrived 2000)

> [My children] didn't have [withheld] classmate friends … That's why they're so happy, because the whole class loves them, they love them. But it's not love, it's just a normal treatment. And this is what you can realize in so many people's way of thinking here in Canada. Most of the Romani people said, "They [Canadians] fell in love with me! They love me so much!" … When I go outside, for walking and they [are] always asking … It's like a normal fashion. "Where is your baby? How is your kid? How is your life? How are you?" Taking those kind of questions [is] normal here in Canada. But … my neighbours, back in [withheld], they didn't say even hello to me … we didn't have any kind of contact with the neighbours. (Katalin, refugee claimant, arrived in 2011)

> We once rented a house when we first got here. It was very nice … we just went there, and at that time no one questioned us. And the landlord rented to us. I saw the question in the application forms that ask where you come from. Most Canadian landlords these days discriminate against Roma tenants … I really wanted to move into the house, because we were in a shelter. And I wanted to move in immediately. The landlord said we had to wait for two weeks to move in, because they had to paint and clean first. To make the house ready. I offered that our whole family would clean the house if we could move in earlier. So the landlord agreed … We painted the house and I cleaned all the windows and all the shelves in the kitchen. It was really clean when I finished. When the landlord came in, he took a look around and said the house has never been as clean as this when you did it. And he took off his shoes and sat down to eat soup with us. So was really nice … We told him that we were Gypsy. He was Italian but there was no problem with us. He said we are all the same. Europeans … Canadians now disapprove of Gypsies coming from [withheld]… every time we presented the application form to landlords, and they saw that we came from [withheld], they rejected us. (Ruby, refugee claimant, arrived in 2010)

> TEM: Believe me or not, whenever I go somewhere, I always tell people I'm Roma. The first time my employer asked me where I'm from, I said [withheld]. Also, I said I am Roma. He didn't say nothing, nothing! No problem! I could walk down the street and scream that I am Roma, sing my song, or something like that.

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

> Aida: Because everything is mixed here. Africa, America, Europe. Equal.
>
> Tem: And I like it, not just for the people, for what you are. (Aida and Tem, refugee claimants, arrived 2012)

Reflection on life in Toronto produces a spectrum of experiences. Frank and Katalin compare it to their experiences in Europe. Frank contrasts the entrenched discrimination he encountered in seeking a job in his country of origin with the respect he is given by employers in Canada. Not only did he establish himself with much ease in Canada, he revels in his treatment "as a human being" and not as a "Gypsy." Katalin also aligns her children's inclusion in the school with "normal treatment" in Canada. For the children, and even for some adults, the absence of hostility is so new that it is mistaken for love. Ruby's cheerful story of acceptance by the first landlord turns negative when subsequent landlords began to interpret the meaning of "Roma tenant" differently after 2010. Tem and Aida give another positive account of the city's multiculturalism, boosting their morale. "Coming out" as Roma is entirely novel, and when they take the risk, they are rewarded with a welcome indifference.

These interview excerpts reveal a resilience in the aftermath of anti-Roma racism and an optimism despite multiple means of discouraging migration. What might these responses imply about the meaning of "home" for Romani asylum-seekers? Researchers describe how transnational groups like the Roma have commitments to host and home societies, but not in any kind of balanced or dualistic way.[41] Belongingness is expressed in multiple ways to both host and home, as well as to other locations.[42] For refugee claimants, however, the concept of "host" and (prospective) home is inflected with a supremely provisional belongingness. For the Roma, belongingness to a European "home" is always affected by everyday racism and of nation states that often refuse to protect them from its impact. Like Freund's participants,[43] their connections may be made not to singular or dual national spaces, but to those that are multiple, regional, local, family, community, and are personally meaningful. This is particularly poignant for the Roma in the antagonistic relations they have with the European countries where they have lived for centuries.

Some observers assert that for many Roma, place may be disconnected from any notion of physical location, ethnicity, or leadership but instead is powerfully tied to the group.[44] Whether the source of economic interdependence, marriage partners, or succour from persistent racism, it is the local Roma community that may constitute the only indissoluble tethering point to place. Home is defined in terms of communal life that is exportable if necessary. Instead of a primordial or spiritual rootedness to space with its institutions and its historicity, the Roma may be rooted to epi-spatial sites inhabited by their network of attachments. Refugee narratives such as those read here describe the forging of new attachments to community organizations, churches, work associates, and neighbours as speakers take early yet hopeful steps toward settlement. Optimism notwithstanding, the likelihood of calling Canada home is contingent on the quality of their acceptance. Changes are afoot. With the abolition of the bar to appeals for DCO applicants in 2015 and the restoration of the Federal Interim Health Benefit in 2016, there are reasons for hope. Longer-term outcomes are always pending. While DCO claimants are no longer restricted from the Refugee Appeal Division, for example, all other restrictions on them remain. Those on the DCO list are moved through the system more quickly, allocated fewer resources, and ensured insufficient time for processing, compared to those from countries excluded from the list. The impact of policy reforms on Romani asylum-seekers requires further research, as do the implications for transnational practices such as the development of networks.

Conclusion

Belongingness is not an inevitable reward but an activity, its precepts indeterminate. In these stories of migration, we hear forays in making a new place home, despite the state's multiple means of discouraging it and despite no European precedent for many. Jules has been waiting four years for a passport and a pension. After their frightening experience of near abandonment at the airport, Aida, Azra, and Tem now participate in the multicultural life of the city. Ruby's family continues their transition, and Katalin witnesses the social inclusion of her children. Frank has accrued more experience than the others and speaks glowingly of his opportunities and responsibility. These voices express agency and resourcefulness, even an eagerness to establish themselves in this new place. Neither an invention[45] nor an "in-betweenness"[46] of home and homeland, for the Roma, settlement is a necessarily contested process that defies formulation. The implications for local community building is a key concern. It is a project to which grassroots organizations and Romani leaders are dedicating themselves.

Notes

1 Foremost acknowledgement is directed to my interview participants. Individuals at the Roma Community Centre who enabled my work were Ronald Lee, Gina Csanyi-Robah, Lynn Hutchinson Lee, Nazik Deniz, and Micheal T. Butch. My assistants were interpreters Amdi Asanoski

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

and Viktoria Mohacsi, and transcriber Mike Thoms. I thank Julianna Beaudoin for her analysis of Immigration and Refugee Board acceptance and success rates, and Maureen Silcoff for her advice on refugee law and policy. In 2013, a Senate Advisory Research Committee grant from Queen's University covered some fieldwork expenses.

2 Council of Europe, *Descriptive Glossary of Terms Relating to Roma Issues* (Strasbourg: Council of Europe Publishing, 2012), http://a.cs.coe.int/team20/cahrom/documents/Glossary%20Roma%20EN%20version%2018%20May%202012.pdf.

3 Cynthia Levine-Rasky, *Writing the Roma: Histories, Policies, and Communities in Canada* (Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 2016).

4 In their small sample of ninety-six cases between 2008 and 2012, Rehaag and his colleagues found that 85.4 per cent of Hungarian claimants were Roma, a reasonable estimate not only for Hungary, but for other source countries in CEE. See Sean Rehaag, Julianna Beaudoin, and Jennifer Danch, "No Refuge: Hungarian Romani Refugee Claimants in Canada," Research Paper no. 12, *Osgoode Hall Law School Legal Studies Research Paper Series* 11, no. 3 (2015): 27.

5 Levine-Rasky, *Writing the Roma.*

6 Charles W. Mills, *The Racial Contract* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997); Patricia Hill Collins, "Black Feminist Thought in the Matrix of Domination," in *Social Theory: The Multicultural and Classic Readings*, ed. Charles Lemert, 615–26 (Boulder, CO: Westview, 1993); Uma Narayan, "Working Together across Difference: Some Considerations on Emotions and Political Practice," *Hypatia* 3, no. 2 (1988): 31–47; George S. Dei, "Theorising Anti-Racism," in *Canadian Perspectives in the Sociology of Education*, ed. Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 51–67 (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 2008). For community-based participatory research, see Bruce A. Collet, "Confronting the Insider-Outsider Polemic in Conducting Research with Diasporic Communities: Towards a Community-Based Approach," *Refuge* 25, no. 1 (2008): 77–83; Stephen Kemmis and Robin McTaggart. "Participatory Action Research: Communicative Action and the Public Sphere," in *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research*, ed. N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln, 3rd ed., 559–603 (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2005); Marge Reitsma-Street and Leslie Brown, "Community Action Research," in *Critical Strategies for Social Research*, ed. William K. Carroll, 303–19 (Toronto: Canadian Scholars', 2004).

7 Liisa Malkki, "Speechless Emissaries: Refugees, Humanitarianism, and Dehistoricization," *Cultural Anthropology* 11 (1996): 377–404.

8 Ratna Omidvar and Dana Wagner, *Flight and Freedom* (Toronto: Between the Lines, 2015).

9 Marie Lacroix, "Canadian Refugee Policy and the Social Construction of the Refugee Claimant Subjectivity: Understating Refugeeness," *Journal of Refugee Studies* 17 (2004): 147–66.

10 Lalai Manjikian, "Refugee 'In-betweenness': A Proactive Existence," *Refuge* 27 (2011): 52–6.

11 Alexander Freund, "Transnationalizing Home in Winnipeg: Refugees' Stories of the Places between the 'Here-and-There,'" *Canadian Ethnic Studies* 47 (2015): 61–86.

12 Esteban C. Acuña, "Romani Mobilities as Resilience Strategies: Trans-Atlantic Expectations, Lives and Journey" (Paper presented to the Second World Congress on Resilience: From Person to Society, Timisoara, Romania, 2014).

13 Zsuzanna Vidra, ed., *Roma Migration to and from Canada: The Czech, Hungarian, and Slovak Case* (Budapest: Center for Policy Studies, Central European University, 2013).

14 Felman and Laub 1992, cited in Patti Lather, "The Validity of Angels: Interpretive and Textual Strategies in Researching the Lives of Women with HIV/AIDS." *Qualitative Inquiry* 1 (1995): 50.

15 David Theo Goldberg, *Racial Subjects: Writing on Race in America* (New York: Routledge, 1997), 24.

16 See Zoltan Barany, *The East European Gypsies: Regime Change, Marginality, and Ethnopolitics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002); Michael Stewart, *The Time of the Gypsies* (Boulder, CO: Westview, 1997); Angus Fraser, *The Gypsies* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 1995); David Crowe, *A History of the Gypsies of Eastern Europe and Russia*, 2nd ed. (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007).

17 Andrej Mirga and Nicolae Gheorghe, *The Roma in the Twenty-First Century: A Policy* (Princeton, NJ: The Project on Ethnic Relations, 1997), http://www.per-usa.org/1997-2007/21st_c.htm.

18 Stewart, *Time of the Gypsies.*

19 See Michael Stewart, ed. *The Gypsy "Menace": Populism and the New Anti-Gypsy Politics* (London: Hurst, 2012); Liz Fekete, *Pedlars of Hate: The Violent Impact of the European Far Right* (London: Institute of Race Relations, 2012), http://www.irr.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2012/06/PedlarsofHate.pdf; Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, *Implementation of the Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area* (Warsaw: Office of Democratic Integration and Human Rights, 2013), http://www.osce.org/odihr/107406; European Roma and Travellers Forum, *The Life of the Roma in Europe* (Strasbourg: European Roma and Travellers Forum, 2015), http://www.ertf.org/images/Newsletter/The_Life_of_Roma_in_Roma_in_Europe_-_August-September_Review__EN.pdf.

20 Jennifer M. Welsh, "The Role of the Inner Enemy in European Self-Definition: Identity, Culture and International Relations Theory," *History of European Ideas* 19 (1994): 58.

21 Arjun Appadurai, *Fear of Small Numbers* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2006).

22 Zygmunt Bauman, *Wasted Lives* (Cambridge: Polity, 2004), 41.

23 European Roma Rights Centre, "Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008–September 2012," 1 October

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

2012, http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf. Also see Amnesty International, *Violent Attacks against Roma in Hungary: Time to Investigate Racial Motivation* (London: Amnesty International Publications, 2010); Bea Bodrogi and Kadar András, ENAR *Shadow Report: Racism and Related Discriminatory Practices in Employment in Hungary* (Brussels: European Network against Racism, 2012); and Lídia Balogh, "Possible Responses to the Sweep of Right-Wing Forces and Anti-Gypsyism in Hungary," in Stewart, *Gypsy "Menace,"* 241–63.

24 Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada, "Hungary: Treatment of Roma and State Protection Efforts (2009–June 2012)," Research Directorate Report HUN104110.E, 16 July 2012, http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca/Eng/ResRec/RirRdi/Pages/index.aspx?doc=454082.

25 The paramilitary wing of the Jobbik Party is known as the Magyar Gárda (Hungarian Guard and its variants). Founded in 2007 by the leader of the Jobbik Party, Gabor Vona, Jobbik registered the Hungarian Guard as a "cultural organization" to "prepare youth spiritually and physically for extraordinary situations when it might be necessary to mobilize the people." Cited in François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights, *Accelerating Patterns of Anti-Roma Violence in Hungary* (Boston: Harvard University Press, 2014), 23.

26 Fekete, "Pedlars of Hate," 6.

27 Kertesi, cited in János Zolnay, "Abusive Language and Discriminatory Measures in Hungarian Local Policy," in Stewart, *Gypsy "Menace,"* 29.

28 Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, *Implementation of the Action Plan*, 27. See also Council of Europe, *Human Rights of Roma and Travellers in Europe*, Commissioner of Human Rights (Strasbourg: Council of Europe Publishing, 2012), http://book.coe.int.

29 The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees qualifies persecution as "a feeling of apprehension and insecurity as regards his future existence … a pattern of discrimination or less favourable treatment could, on cumulative grounds, amount to persecution and warrant international protection … if measures of discrimination lead to consequences of a substantially prejudicial nature for the person concerned, e.g. serious restrictions on the right to earn one's livelihood, the right to practice one's religion, or access to available educational facilities." See United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, *Handbook and Guideline on Procedures and Criteria for Determining Refugee Status under the 1951 Convention and the 1967 Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees* (Geneva: UNHCR, 2011), 14, 82. For debates around the threshold for persecution, see Rebecca Dowd, "Dissecting Discrimination in Refugee Law: An Analysis of Its Meaning and Its Cumulative Effect," *International Journal of Refugee Law* 23 (2010): 28–53; and Edward C. Corrigan, "Test for Well-Foundedness of a Fear of Persecution under Canadian Refugee Law," *ImmQuest* 3 (2007): 9–11.

30 Data were provided by Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada in their Country Reports, 1997 to 30 June 2015, upon request by the author. All calculations are those of the author. For a detailed discussion, see Levine-Rasky, *Writing the Roma*.

31 In February 2015, the Canadian Association of Refugee Lawyers and other parties challenged the bar to appeals in the DCO system as a violation of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms. In their statement, the litigants referred to the Roma and other minorities. Federal Court judge Mr. Justice Keith Boswell delivered his decision on 23 July in favour of the litigants.

32 Steven Chase and Tamara Baluja, "Tories Introduce Bill to Thwart 'Bogus' Refugees," *Globe and Mail*, 17 February 2012.

33 Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "Minister Jason Kenney Meets with Roma Leaders in Hungary," news release, 9 October 2012; Karl Nerenberg, "Right-Wing Hate, the Roma People and Jason Kenney's Trip to Hungary," rabble.ca, 11 October 2012, http://rabble.ca/blogs/bloggers/karl-nerenberg/2012/10/right-wing-hate-roma-people-and-jason-kenneys-trip-hungary.

34 "Náciveszélyt Riogatnak a Kanadába Emigráló Retkesek: Célpont (2011-12-04)," http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=P20EWZAXXVK&feature=related (begins at 1:37) uploaded by Vácigyűjtő on 4 December 2011, trans. Gina Csanyi-Robah.

35 Poynter 2013, cited in Julianna C. Beaudoin, "Challenging Essentialized Representations of Romani Identities in Canada" (PhD diss., University of Western Ontario, 2014), 122.

36 Nicholas Keung, "Roma Refugees: Canadian Billboards in Hungary Warn of Deportation," *Star*, 25 January 2013, original emphasis, http://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2013/01/25/roma_refugees_canadian_billboards_in_hungary_warn_of_deportation.html.

37 BJ Siekierski, "When Hungarian Extremists Approve: The Harper Government vs. the Roma," ipolitics, 20 June 2013, http://www.ipolitics.ca/2013/06/20/when-hungarian-extremists-approve-the-harper-government-vs-the-roma/.

38 Upon his appointment on 4 November 2015, Minister of Immigration, Refugees, and Citizenship John McCallum promised to fully restore the Interim Federal Health Program for refugees and refugee claimants. McCallum declared that the cuts were "cruel and unusual, and it was economically stupid because it probably cost the Canadian taxpayer more." CBC.ca, "Liberals to Fully Restore Refugee Health-care Cuts, Says John McCallum," *The House*, 7 November 2015, http://www.cbc.ca/radio/thehouse/meet-your-new-government-1.3305229/liberals-to-fully-restore-refugee-health-care-cuts-says-john-mccallum-1.3305978.

39 Malkki, "Speechless Emissaries."

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.

40 Meredith Minkler, "Ethical Challenges for the 'Outsider' Researcher in Community-Based Participatory Research," *Health, Education & Behavior* 31 (2004): 684–97.
41 See Pnina Werbner, "Theorising Complex Diasporas: Purity and Hybridity in the Diasporic Public Sphere," *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 30 (2004): 895–911; and Robin Cohen, ed., *Theories of Migration* (Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar, 1996).
42 Rudhramoorthy Cheran, "Multiple Homes and Parallel Civil Societies: Refugee Diasporas and Transnationalism," *Refuge* 23, no. 2 (2006): 3.
43 Freund, "Transnationalizing Home."
44 Stewart, *Time of the Gypsies.*
45 Liisa Malkki, "National Geographic: The Rooting of Peoples and the Territorialization of National Identity among Scholars and Refugees," *Cultural Anthropology* 7 (1992): 24.
46 Freund, "Transnationalizing Home," 66.

Cynthia Levine-Rasky is associate professor in the Department of Sociology at Queen's University. The author may be contacted at clrdomain@gmail.com.

© Cynthia Levine-Rasky, 2016. This open-access work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License, which permits use, reproduction and distribution in any medium for non-commercial purposes, provided the original author(s) are credited and the original publication in Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees is cited.