

Refugee

VOL. 25 • NO. 2

CANADA'S PERIODICAL ON REFUGEES

FALL 2008

Building a Better Refugee Status Determination System

BUILDING THE INFRASTRUCTURE FOR THE OBSERVANCE
OF REFUGEE RIGHTS IN THE GLOBAL SOUTH

Barbara Harrell-Bond

REFUGEE STATUS DETERMINATION IN BRAZIL: A TRIPARTITE ENTERPRISE
Liliana Lyra Jubilut and Silvia Menicucci de Oliveira Selmi Apolinário

A FOOT IN THE DOOR: ACCESS TO ASYLUM IN SOUTH AFRICA

Darshan Vigneswaran

AN EVALUATION OF SOUTH AFRICA'S APPLICATION
OF THE OAU REFUGEE DEFINITION

Tal Hanna Schreier

RESPONSIBILITY SHARING OR SHIFTING? "SAFE" THIRD COUNTRIES
AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

Michelle Foster

CANADA'S REFUGEE STATUS DETERMINATION SYSTEM
AND THE INTERNATIONAL NORM OF INDEPENDENCE

Gerald P. Heckman



Refuge

CANADA'S PERIODICAL ON REFUGEES

Vol. 25 No. 2

Centre for Refugee Studies, Room 845, York Research Tower, York University
4700 Keele Street, Toronto, Ontario, Canada M3J 1P3
Phone: 416-736-5843 Fax: 416-736-5837 E-mail: refuge@yorku.ca
Web site: <http://www.yorku.ca/refuge>

Editor-in-Chief Sharryn J. Aiken
Guest Editors France Houle
Martin Jones
Senior Editorial Assistant Negin Dahya
Junior Editorial Assistant Lorenzo Vargas

Editorial Advisory Board

*François Crépeau, Janet Dench, Barbara Harrell-Bond, James C. Hathaway,
Judith Kumin, Michael Lanphier, Susan McGrath, Obiora Okafor*

Junior Editors Heather-Laurel Peters, Wesley Jordan Oakes,
Stephen Charles Kaduuli

Founded in 1981, *Refuge* is an interdisciplinary journal co-published by the Centre for Refugee Studies, York University, and Queen's University. The journal aims to provide a forum for discussion and critical reflection on refugee and forced migration issues.

Refuge invites contributions from researchers, practitioners, and policy makers with national, international, or comparative perspectives. Special, thematic issues address the broad scope of the journal's mandate, featuring articles and reports, shorter commentaries, and book reviews. With the exception of formally solicited work, all submissions to *Refuge* are subject to double-blinded peer review. Articles are accepted in either English or French.

Refuge is a non-profit, independent periodical funded by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada and supported by subscriptions. The views expressed in *Refuge* do not necessarily reflect those of its funders or editors.

Refuge is indexed and abstracted in the *Index to Canadian Legal Literature*, *Pais International*, *Sociological Abstracts*, the *International Bibliography of the Social Sciences*, and *Canadian Business and Current Affairs*. The full text of articles published in *Refuge* is also available on-line through the Gale Group databases, accessible in many university libraries. *Refuge* is also available online through Lexis-Nexis's Quicklaw service.

Typesetting and production services were provided by Becker Associates.

ISSN: 0229-5113

Contents

EDITORIAL

- “Building a Better Refugee Status Determination System” *Martin Jones
and France Houle* 3

FEATURE ARTICLES

- Building the Infrastructure for the Observance
of Refugee Rights in the Global South *Barbara Harrell-Bond* 12
- Refugee Status Determination in Brazil:
A Tripartite Enterprise *Liliana Lyra Jubilut
and Silvia Menicucci de Oliveira Selmi Apolinário* 29
- A Foot in the Door: Access to Asylum
in South Africa *Darshan Vigneswaran* 41
- An Evaluation of South Africa’s Application
of the OAU Refugee Definition *Tal Hanna Schreier* 53
- Responsibility Sharing or Shifting?
“Safe” Third Countries and International Law *Michelle Foster* 64
- Canada’s Refugee Status Determination System
and the International Norm of Independence *Gerald P. Heckman* 79
- Thamotharem* and Guideline 7 of the IRB: Rethinking
the Scope of the Fettering of Discretion Doctrine *France Houle* 103
- The Guideline on Procedures with Respect to
Vulnerable Persons Appearing Before the Immigration
and Refugee Board of Canada: A Critical Overview *Janet Cleveland* 119
- Abandoning Refugees? An Analysis of the Legal
Framework Governing Non-compliant Claimants in Canada *Martin Jones* 132
- The Many Faces of “Prima Facie”:
Group-Based Evidence in Refugee Status Determination *Jean-François Durieux* 151

Explaining Inequality in the Implementation of Asylum Law	<i>Peter Mascini</i>	164
The Use of COI in the Refugee Status Determination Process in the UK: Looking Back, Reaching Forward.	<i>Jo Pettitt, Laurel Townhead, and Stephanie Huber</i>	182
Life after Refusal to Enter: Reflections of an Immigration Judge	<i>Geoffrey Care</i>	195
Research Workshop on Critical Issues in International Refugee Law May 1 and 2, 2008, York University	<i>James C. Simeon</i>	202
OTHER ARTICLE		
Refugees, Inequality, and Human Development	<i>Anthony H. Richmond</i>	212